

**BEFORE THE  
FEDERAL MOTOR CARRIER SAFETY ADMINISTRATION**

**In the Matter of:**

**FALAH TRADER, INC.,**

**Respondent.**

**Docket No. FMCSA-2009-0079<sup>1</sup>  
(Eastern Service Center)**

**ORDER ON BINDING ARBITRATION**

**1. Background**

On January 5, 2009, the New York Division Administrator for the Federal Motor Carrier Safety Administration (FMCSA) issued a Notice of Claim (NOC) charging Respondent, Falah Trader, Inc., with one violation of 49 CFR 382.115(b) for failing to implement an alcohol and/or controlled substances testing program. The NOC proposed a civil penalty of \$1,790.

On January 22, 2009, Respondent replied to the NOC. In its Reply, Respondent did not contest the violation and requested that the civil penalty be reduced. On March 17, 2009, the Field Administrator for FMCSA's Eastern Service Center, stated that the Reply was in essence a request for binding arbitration, to which he did not object.

**2. Procedures**

The arbitration process will be conducted pursuant to FMCSA's published guidance on this subject.<sup>2</sup> The parties will work together to select an arbitrator and establish procedures that will govern the binding arbitration. The parties will be

---

<sup>1</sup> The prior case number of this matter was NY-2008-0676-US0773.

<sup>2</sup> See *Guidance for the Use of Binding Arbitration under the Administrative Dispute Resolution Act of 1996*, Docket No. FMCSA-2003-14794, 69 Fed. Reg. 10288, March 4, 2004.

contacted by a representative from the Department of Transportation's Center for Alternative Dispute Resolution (CADR), who will answer any questions the parties may have about the process and will assist the parties in choosing an arbitrator.

a. Options in Choosing the Arbitrator

The parties may choose an arbitrator from the following sources:

1. Civilian Board of Contract Appeals Judges or representatives from other government agencies who have been trained in arbitration;
2. Uncompensated neutral parties from local communities; or
3. Compensated neutral parties from outside the government, whose costs are to be shared by agreement of the parties.

The selected arbitrator will assist the parties in developing procedures and preparing an Arbitration Agreement.

b. Arbitration Format

Respondent may have attorney or non-attorney representation, or it may appear *pro se*, that is, it may represent itself in the arbitration proceedings. With the consent of both parties, the arbitrator may conduct hearings in person or by telephone, video conferencing, or computer.

Each party will present evidence supporting the penalty and terms of payment it considers appropriate. The evidence may not contest whether or not the violation occurred because Respondent has conceded the violation as a condition of arbitration. Neither written submissions nor oral argument may contain any reference to the amount of the civil penalty proposed by the party. At a time specified by the arbitrator, each party will present to the arbitrator and to the opposing party a sealed envelope containing

the amount of its total proposed civil penalty and a proposed payment plan. Before opening the envelopes, the arbitrator will determine the appropriate civil penalty and payment plan based upon the evidence presented during the proceeding. The arbitrator will provide his or her determinations in writing to the parties. The arbitrator will then open the envelopes and select the civil penalty and payment plan that is closer to the arbitrator's determinations. The arbitrator has the discretion to select one party's proposed total civil penalty and the other party's proposed payment plan.


c. Maximum and Minimum Penalty Amounts

The parties may not propose an amount higher than the amount assessed in the NOC. There is no minimum statutory penalty for the violation.

d. Limited Appeals

The arbitration award is binding on the parties. Appeals from arbitration awards are generally limited to fraud or misconduct in the proceedings. *See* Federal Arbitration Act, 9 U.S.C. § 10.

*It Is So Ordered.*

  
Rose A. McMurray  
Assistant Administrator  
Federal Motor Carrier Safety Administration

4-24-09  
Date

# CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

This is to certify that on this 21 day of April, 2009 the undersigned mailed or delivered, as specified, the designated number of copies of the foregoing document to the persons listed below.

Ahmed Patel  
Falah Trader, Inc.  
Dba Falah Transport  
1468 Victoria Park Avenue  
Toronto ON M4A 2M2  
Phone: (416) 285-0110  
Facsimile: (416) 285-0180

One Copy  
U.S. Mail

Anthony G. Lardieri, Esq.  
Trial Attorney  
Office of Chief Counsel (MC-CCE)  
Federal Motor Carrier Safety Administration  
Eastern Service Center  
802 Cromwell Park Drive, Suite N  
Glen Burnie, MD 21061  
Phone: (443) 703-2248  
Facsimile: (443) 703-2253

One Copy  
U.S. Mail

Robert W. Miller, Field Administrator  
Federal Motor Carrier Safety Administration  
Eastern Service Center  
802 Cromwell Park Drive, Suite N  
Glen Burnie, MD 21061

One Copy  
U.S. Mail

Brian Temperine  
New York Division Administrator  
Federal Motor Carrier Safety Administration  
Leo W. O'Brien Federal Building, Room 815  
Clinton Avenue & N. Pearl Street  
Albany, NY 12207

One Copy  
U.S. Mail

Fern Feil Kaufman  
Counsel for Dispute Resolution  
U.S. Department of Transportation  
Center for Alternative Dispute Resolution  
West Building, Room W96-421  
1200 New Jersey Avenue, S.E.  
Washington, D.C. 20590  
(202) 385-CADR

One Copy  
Personal Delivery

FMCSA-2009-0079

U.S. Department of Transportation  
Docket Operations, M-30  
West Building Ground Floor  
Room W12-140  
1200 New Jersey Avenue, S.E.  
Washington, D.C. 20590

Original  
Personal Delivery

A handwritten signature in cursive script, reading "Annie Miller", is written over a horizontal line.